

# Why full-day kindergarten is failing our children

WHEN GERMAN EDUCATOR Friedrich Fröbel opened the world's first kindergartens in the mid-1800s, he frequently found himself at odds with suspicious government officials. Prussia, for example, banned his schools in 1851, characterizing them as hotbeds of socialist subversion and radicalism.

How things have changed. Today, most governments want more kindergarten, not less. Even the traditional half-day programs aren't enough. Five-year-olds in British Columbia, Quebec, New Brunswick, Nova Scotia and Prince Edward Island all attend full-day kindergarten. Ontario is currently in the fourth year of a five-year rollout for full-day junior and senior kindergarten, meaning kids as young as three attend school all day, five days a week. In those provinces without full-day programs, demands are heard regularly.

Yet despite the popularity of full-day kindergarten, particularly among working parents and teachers' unions, the actual benefit it provides to the children themselves is still hotly debated.

This September, on the first day of the school year, the Ontario government claimed conclusive evidence of full-day kindergarten's advantages was finally at hand, thanks to a pair of academic studies it commissioned. "In every area, students improved their readiness for Grade 1 and accelerated their development," a provincial news release declared.

Education Minister Liz Sandals called the results, which tracked students in both half- and full-day kindergarten over two years, "nothing short of incredible."

This news was immediately hailed by supporters of the concept. Charles Pascal, the driving force behind Ontario's full-day program, said "it shows the program is truly a life-changer." In a front-page story, the *Globe and Mail* dubbed it a "landmark study."

And yet there was no study to read, landmark or otherwise. The hype and excitement came from a few bullet points selectively released by the province. The actual reports were nowhere to be seen. The reason for this reticence is now apparent.

With the complete reports finally available online, it appears that Ontario's \$1.5-billion-a-year full-day kindergarten experiment is a grave disappointment, from both pedagogical and financial perspectives.

The provincial studies did find that children attending schools marked by low income and/or poor test scores showed improvement in some categories after participating in full-day kindergarten. This corresponds with previous research, particularly by Nobel laureate economist James Heckman, which suggested that early intervention can improve school readiness for disadvantaged children. For everyone else, however, the Ontario results ranged from negligible to abysmal.



Not only did most children not receive a distinct advantage from spending all week at school, the results for many were lower than if they'd stayed in the old half-day system.

"To be clear, some children appear to have done worse with [full-day early learning kindergarten]," the report states. The biggest failings were in the categories of emotional maturity, communication skills and general knowledge. This aligns with complaints that full-day programs impede the social and emotional development of some children by removing them from familial care too early.

Special-needs kids did particularly poorly. "The children with special educational needs showed superior outcomes on the measures of social competence and emotional maturity in non-[full-day early learning kindergarten] programs," the researchers found, calling for more investigation into this troubling result. It's a far cry from declaring the whole thing "life-changing" or "nothing short of incredible."

It is worth noting that even those gains identified for some kids are likely to be temporary, a phenomenon that's been identified



## STEPHEN HARPER EXCLUSIVE

In next week's issue of *Maclean's*, the Prime Minister sits down for an exclusive one-on-one interview with Ken Whyte to discuss his much-anticipated book, *A Great Game: The Forgotten Leafs and the Rise of Professional Hockey*

## IPAD EXCLUSIVES

**FESCHUK VS. BEER PONG** Read all the replies Scott Feschuk received when he put out the call for higher-education advice

**MACLEAN'S ON CAMPUS** See all of our extended photo galleries of student life from coast to coast

**GILLER PRIZE** Read exclusive interviews with Lynn Coady and Dennis Bock, plus excerpts from their nominated books

**THE SHADOW LANDS** See more of Graeme Roy's stark black-and-white photos of Toronto's financial district

**SHELLING OUT** Acclaimed Vancouver chef David Hawksworth shares his recipe for oysters Rockefeller



LEFT: JEFFREY CHAFFERS/REUTERS; JASON HANCOCK/PHOTO/REUTERS; CLAY WILLIAMS/REUTERS/PHOTO/REUTERS



in numerous other studies. McMaster University economist Philip DeCicca told *Maclean's* earlier this year that any positive academic effects arising from full-day kindergarten are largely gone by the end of Grade 1. (See "The munchkin invasion," National, May 27.) Similarly, a study published last year on California's school system found that, after three years, "there were no significant differences in students who attended the all-day kindergarten program and students who attended a traditional kindergarten program."

Full-day kindergarten does nothing to permanently improve academic performance. It may stunt the emotional and social development of many kids. And it does not favour to those with special needs. While children from poor or disadvantaged families may derive short-term benefits from extra attention in kindergarten, it defies common sense and financial reality to provide this to all families on a universal basis. The tax system or local authorities are much better suited to targeting children at risk, and at far less cost.

All the above suggests taxpayers in prov-

inces that have so far managed to avoid the full-day-kindergarten craze ought to consider themselves quite lucky. Earlier this year, for example, Alberta announced it was putting its plans for province-wide full-day kindergarten on hold due to budgetary constraints. Wise move.

**MACLEAN'S INTRODUCED OUR** University Issue in 1991—meaning anyone who was born that year may have already finished an undergraduate degree. A lot has changed over the past 23 years, both on campus and in these pages. Our annual special issue has gone from a first-of-its-kind ranking of post-secondary institutions to an irreplaceable tool for Canadian students and their parents making the single biggest decision of a young person's life. We have expanded significantly over the years, adding new surveys and reams of easy-to-use data. We've also established a hefty online presence at *oncampus.macleans.ca*, where you will find our popular personalized university ranking tool, which allows you to mix and match data, and weight your preferences in six areas (such as student-to-faculty ratio), producing a list of schools based on what is most important to you. And yet, the biggest changes have been going on at schools themselves. From the focus on first-year advisers to the enrolment push of international students to fill both chairs and coffers, Canadian universities are more attuned than ever to the demands of students and their families. Keep in mind, however, that there's no single "best" university or college in Canada. Rather, your target should be the best school for you, based on your own preferences, interests, abilities and educational goals. It's out there—you just have to find it. *Maclean's* is happy to help. ♣

## MACLEAN'S

PUBLISHER Penny Hicks EDITOR Mark Stevenson  
DEPUTY EDITOR Anne Marie Owens  
SENIOR EXECUTIVE EDITOR Peeter Kopvilem (on leave)  
MANAGING EDITORS Sue Allan,  
Sarmishta Subramanian, Dianna Symonds  
EDITOR, SPECIAL ISSUES Kim Honey  
POLITICAL EDITOR Paul Wells  
SENIOR EDITORS Colin Campbell (Business),  
Mary Dwyer (University Rankings), Jason Kirby (National)  
NATIONAL CORRESPONDENTS Jonathon Gatehouse, Charlie Gillis  
SENIOR WRITERS Brian Bethune, Michael Friscolanti, Brian D. Johnson,  
Anne Kingston, Michael Petrou, Chris Sorensen  
ASSOCIATE EDITORS Cathy Gulki, Kate Lunau, Nancy Macdonald (on leave),  
Tamsin McMahon, Jaime J. Weinman, Aaron Wherry, Lindsey Wiebe  
ASSISTANT EDITOR Emma Teitel  
CONTRIBUTING EDITORS Barbara Amiel, Josh Dehaas,  
Scott Feschuk, Adnan R. Khan, Peter C. Newman  
EDITOR AT LARGE Peter Shawn Taylor

### BUREAUS

OTTAWA: John Geddes (EDITOR) · QUEBEC: Martin Patriquin (BUREAU CHIEF)  
ALBERTA: Colby Cosh · BRITISH COLUMBIA: Ken MacQueen  
WASHINGTON: Luiza Ch. Savage  
COPY EDITORS Michael Barclay, Larissa Liepins  
RESEARCHER-REPORTER Patricia Treble  
INTERNS Aaron Hutchins,  
Nick Taylor-Vaisey, Rosemary Westwood

### DESIGN

ART DIRECTOR Stephen Gregory  
ASSOCIATE ART DIRECTOR Levi Nicholson  
DESIGNERS Lauren Cattermole, Sarah MacKinnon

### PHOTO DEPARTMENT

DIRECTOR OF PHOTOGRAPHY Andrew Tolson  
ASSOCIATE PHOTO EDITORS Liz Sullivan,  
Jessica Darmanin, Jeff Harris (on leave)  
CONTRIBUTING PHOTO EDITOR Jenna Marie Wakani  
PRODUCTION AND TECHNOLOGY  
MANAGER, EDITORIAL PRODUCTION Barry Hertz  
PRODUCTION EDITOR Jennifer Brown  
DIGITAL COLOUR SPECIALISTS Richard Redditt, Andre Singh  
PRODUCTION MANAGER Roma Hula  
PUBLISHING APPLICATIONS MANAGER James Reid  
ADMINISTRATION  
EDITORIAL ASSISTANT Julia De Laurentis Johnson

### ROGERS PUBLISHING LIMITED

EXECUTIVE PUBLISHER Lorraine Hoeffler  
EDITORIAL DIRECTOR Dianne de Fenoyl  
CREATIVE DIRECTOR Jason Logan  
SENIOR GROUP DIRECTOR, CONSUMER MARKETING Elizabeth Nixon

### HOW TO REACH US

VISIT: [www.macleans.ca/service](http://www.macleans.ca/service)  
CUSTOMER SERVICE AND SUBSCRIPTIONS  
[service@macleans.ca](mailto:service@macleans.ca) · 1-888-MACLEANS (1-888-622-5326)  
BY MAIL: Maclean's, P.O. Box 860 Station Main, Markham, Ont. L3P 8H8  
TO COMMENT ON THE MAGAZINE: 1-800-268-9119 ext. 1706  
TO ORDER BACK ISSUES: 1-866-301-4414  
ADVERTISING: [adsales@macleans.ca](mailto:adsales@macleans.ca) · 416-764-1300  
LETTERS TO THE EDITOR AND STORY PROPOSALS  
BY MAIL: *Maclean's*, 11th Floor,  
One Mount Pleasant Road, Toronto, Ont. M4Y 2Y5  
BY EMAIL: [letters@macleans.ca](mailto:letters@macleans.ca)  
BY FAX: 416-764-1332 (Provide your name, address and phone number.  
Letters may be edited for length and clarity)  
EDITORIAL DEPARTMENT: Tel. 416-764-1339 · Fax 416-764-1332  
From time to time other organizations may ask *Maclean's* if they may send information about a product or service to some *Maclean's* subscribers, by mail or email. If you do not wish to receive these messages, contact us in any of the ways listed above.

*Maclean's*, established 1905, is published weekly, except for occasional combined, expanded or premium issues, which count as two subscription issues, by Rogers Publishing Limited, a division of Rogers Media Inc. Rogers Publishing Limited, One Mount Pleasant Road, Toronto, Ont. M4Y 2Y5. Montreal office: 1200 avenue McGill College, Bureau 800, Montreal, Que. H3B 4G7.

Contents Copyright © 2013 by Rogers Publishing Limited, may not be reprinted without permission. *Maclean's* receives unsolicited materials (including letters to the editor, press releases, promotional items and images) from time to time. *Maclean's*, its affiliates and assignees may use, reproduce, publish, re-publish, distribute, store and archive such unsolicited submissions in whole or in part in any form or medium whatsoever, without compensation of any sort. This statement does not apply to materials/pitches submitted by freelance writers, photographers or illustrators in accordance with known industry practices.

OUR ENVIRONMENTAL POLICY IS AVAILABLE AT:  
[www.rogerspublishing.ca/environment](http://www.rogerspublishing.ca/environment)

*Maclean's* ISSN 0024-9262

Full subscription price for one year is \$75.00 plus applicable taxes:  
U.S.A., \$99.00 surface, all other countries, \$229.00 airmail.

Publications Mail Agreement No. 40070230

We acknowledge the financial support of the Government of Canada through the Canada Periodical Fund of the Department of Canadian Heritage.

PRINTED IN CANADA



### ONLY AT MACLEANS.CA: INSIDE THE CONVENTION

Paul Wells and Colby Cosh report from the 2013 Conservative convention in Calgary. Plus, exclusive analysis from *Maclean's* Ottawa bureau throughout the weekend.



### ON NEWSSTANDS NOW: THE GUIDE TO JOBS

From the hottest jobs and what they pay to the fastest-growing industries, the *Maclean's 2014 Guide to Jobs in Canada* offers a comprehensive look at where the best opportunities are to find work